

Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF)
Request for Comments: 8727
Category: Standards Track
ISSN: 2070-1721

T. Takahashi
NICT
R. Danyliw
CERT
M. Suzuki
NICT
August 2020

JSON Binding of the Incident Object Description Exchange Format

Abstract

The Incident Object Description Exchange Format (IODEF) defined in RFC 7970 provides an information model and a corresponding XML data model for exchanging incident and indicator information. This document gives implementers and operators an alternative format to exchange the same information by defining an alternative data model implementation in JSON and its encoding in Concise Binary Object Representation (CBOR).

Status of This Memo

This is an Internet Standards Track document.

This document is a product of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). It represents the consensus of the IETF community. It has received public review and has been approved for publication by the Internet Engineering Steering Group (IESG). Further information on Internet Standards is available in Section 2 of RFC 7841.

Information about the current status of this document, any errata, and how to provide feedback on it may be obtained at <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8727>.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2020 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction
 - 1.1. Requirements Language
2. IODEF Data Types
 - 2.1. Abstract Data Type to JSON Data Type Mapping
 - 2.2. Complex JSON Types
 - 2.2.1. Integer
 - 2.2.2. Multilingual Strings
 - 2.2.3. Enum
 - 2.2.4. Software and Software Reference
 - 2.2.5. Structured Information
 - 2.2.6. EXTENSION
3. IODEF JSON Data Model
 - 3.1. Classes and Elements
 - 3.2. Mapping between JSON and XML IODEF
4. Examples

- 4.1. Minimal Example
- 4.2. Indicators from a Campaign
- 5. Mapkeys
- 6. The IODEF Data Model (CDDL)
- 7. IANA Considerations
- 8. Security Considerations
- 9. References
 - 9.1. Normative References
 - 9.2. Informative References
- Appendix A. Data Types Used in This Document
- Appendix B. The IODEF Data Model (JSON Schema)
- Acknowledgments
- Authors' Addresses

1. Introduction

The Incident Object Description Exchange Format (IODEF) [RFC7970] defines a data representation for security incident reports and indicators commonly exchanged by operational security teams. It facilitates the automated exchange of this information to enable mitigation and watch-and-warning. An information model using Unified Modeling Language (UML) is defined in Section 3 of [RFC7970] and a corresponding Extensible Markup Language (XML) schema data model is defined in Section 8 of [RFC7970]. This UML-based information model and XML-based data model are referred to as IODEF UML and IODEF XML, respectively, in this document.

IODEF documents are structured and thus suitable for machine processing. They will streamline incident response operations. Another well-used and structured format that is suitable for machine processing is JavaScript Object Notation (JSON) [RFC8259]. To facilitate the automation of incident response operations, IODEF documents and implementations should support JSON representation and its encoding in Concise Binary Object Representation (CBOR) [RFC7049].

This document defines an alternate implementation of the IODEF UML information model by specifying a JSON data model using Concise Data Definition Language (CDDL) [RFC8610] and a JSON Schema [JSON-SCHEMA]. This JSON data model is referred to as IODEF JSON in this document. IODEF JSON provides all of the expressivity of IODEF XML. It gives implementers and operators an alternative format to exchange the same information.

The normative IODEF JSON data model is found in Section 6. Sections 2 and 3 describe the data types and elements of this data model. Section 4 provides examples.

1.1. Requirements Language

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "NOT RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in BCP 14 [RFC2119] [RFC8174] when, and only when, they appear in all capitals, as shown here.

2. IODEF Data Types

IODEF JSON implements the abstract data types specified in Section 2 of [RFC7970].

2.1. Abstract Data Type to JSON Data Type Mapping

IODEF JSON uses native and derived JSON data types. Table 1 describes the mapping between the abstract data types in Section 2 of [RFC7970] and their corresponding implementations in IODEF JSON.

IODEF Data Type	Reference	JSON Data Type
INTEGER	Section 2.1 of [RFC7970]	integer; see

		Section 2.2.1
REAL	Section 2.2 of [RFC7970]	"number" per [RFC8259]
CHARACTER	Section 2.3 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
STRING	Section 2.3 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
ML_STRING	Section 2.4 of [RFC7970]	see Section 2.2.2
BYTE	Section 2.5.1 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
BYTE[]	Section 2.5.1 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
HEXBIN	Section 2.5.2 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
HEXBIN[]	Section 2.5.2 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
ENUM	Section 2.6 of [RFC7970]	see Section 2.2.3
DATETIME	Section 2.7 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
TIMEZONE	Section 2.8 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
PORTLIST	Section 2.9 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
POSTAL	Section 2.10 of [RFC7970]	ML_STRING; see Section 2.2.2
PHONE	Section 2.11 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
EMAIL	Section 2.12 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
URL	Section 2.13 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
ID	Section 2.14 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
IDREF	Section 2.14 of [RFC7970]	"string" per [RFC8259]
SOFTWARE	Section 2.15 of [RFC7970]	see Section 2.2.4
STRUCTUREDINFO	Section 4.4 of [RFC7203]	see Section 2.2.5
EXTENSION	Section 2.16 of [RFC7970]	see Section 2.2.6

Table 1: JSON Data Types

IODEF Data Type	CBOR Data Type	CDDL Prelude [RFC8610]
-----------------	----------------	------------------------

INTEGER	0, 1, 6 tag 2, 6 tag 3	integer
REAL	7 bits 26	float32
CHARACTER	3	text
STRING	3	text
ML_STRING	5	Maps/Structs (Section 3.5.1 of [RFC8610])
BYTE	6 tag 22	eb64legacy
BYTE[]	6 tag 22	eb64legacy
HEXBIN	6 tag 23	eb16
HEXBIN[]	6 tag 23	eb16
ENUM	-	Choices (Section 2.2.2 of [RFC8610])
DATETIME	6 tag 0	tdate
TIMEZONE	3	text
PORTLIST	3	text
POSTAL	3	ML_STRING (Section 2.2.2)
PHONE	3	text
EMAIL	3	text
URL	6 tag 32	uri
ID	3	text
IDREF	3	text
SOFTWARE	5	Maps/Structs (Section 3.5.1 of [RFC8610])
STRUCTUREDINFO	5	Maps/Structs (Section 3.5.1 of [RFC8610])
EXTENSION	5	Maps/Structs (Section 3.5.1 of [RFC8610])

Table 2: CBOR Data Types

2.2. Complex JSON Types

2.2.1. Integer

An integer is a subset of the "number" type of JSON, which represents signed digits encoded in Base 10. The definition of this integer is "[minus] int" per [RFC8259], Section 6.

2.2.2. Multilingual Strings

A string that needs to be represented in a human-readable language different from the default encoding of the document is represented in the information model by the ML_STRING data type. This data type is implemented as either an object with "value", "lang", and "translation-id" elements or a text string as defined in Section 6. An example is shown below.

```
"MLStringType": {
```

```

"value": "free-form text",           # STRING
"lang": "en",                       # ENUM
"translation-id": "jp2en0023"      # STRING
}

```

Note that in figures throughout this document, some supplementary information follows "#", but these are not valid syntax in JSON; instead, they are intended to facilitate reader understanding.

2.2.3. Enum

Enum is an ordered list of acceptable string values. Each value has a representative keyword. Within the data model, the enumerated type keywords are used as attribute values.

2.2.4. Software and Software Reference

A particular version of software is represented in the information model by the SOFTWARE data type. This software can be described by using a reference, a Uniform Resource Locator (URL) [RFC3986], or free-form text. The SOFTWARE data type is implemented as an object with "SoftwareReference", "URL", and "Description" elements as defined in Section 6. Examples are shown below.

```

"SoftwareType": {
  "SoftwareReference": {...},           # SoftwareReference
  "Description": ["MS Windows"]        # STRING
}

```

SoftwareReference class is a reference to a particular version of software. Examples are shown below.

```

"SoftwareReference": {
  "value": "cpe:/a:google:chrome:59.0.3071.115", # STRING
  "spec-name": "cpe",                          # ENUM
  "dtype": "string"                             # ENUM
}

```

2.2.5. Structured Information

Information provided in the form of a structured string, such as an ID, or structured information, such as XML documents, is represented in the information model by the STRUCTUREDINFO data type. Note that this type was originally specified in Section 4.4 of [RFC7203] as a basic structure of its extension classes. The STRUCTUREDINFO data type is implemented as an object with "SpecID", "ext-SpecID", "ContentID", "RawData", and "Reference" elements. An example for embedding a structured ID is shown below.

```

"STRUCTUREDINFO": {
  "SpecID": "urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:mile:cwe:3.3", # ENUM
  "ContentID": "CWE-89"                            # STRING
}

```

When embedding the raw data, it should be encoded as a BYTE type object, as shown below.

```

"STRUCTUREDINFO": {
  "SpecID": "urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:mile:mndef:1.2", # ENUM
  "RawData": "<<< encoded structured data >>>"    # BYTE
}

```

When embedding the raw data, base64 encoding defined in Section 4 of [RFC4648] MUST be used for JSON IODEF while binary representation MUST be used for CBOR IODEF.

2.2.6. EXTENSION

Information not otherwise represented in the IODEF can be added using the EXTENSION data type. This data type is a generic extension mechanism. The EXTENSION data type is implemented as an

ExtensionType object with "value", "name", "dtype", "ext-dtype", "meaning", "formatid", "restriction", "ext-restriction", and "observable-id" elements. An example for embedding a structured ID is shown below.

```
"ExtensionType": {
  "value": "xxxxxxx",           # STRING
  "name": "Syslog",           # STRING
  "dtype": "string",         # ENUM
  "meaning": "Syslog from the security appliance X" # STRING
}
```

Note that this data type is specified in [RFC7970] as its generic extension mechanism. If a data item has internal structure that is intended to be processed outside of the IODEF framework, one may consider using the STRUCTUREDINFO data type mentioned in Section 2.2.5.

3. IODEF JSON Data Model

3.1. Classes and Elements

The following table shows the list of IODEF classes and their elements and the corresponding sections in [RFC7970]. Note that the complete JSON schema is defined in Section 6 using CDDL.

IODEF Class	Class, Element, and Attribute	Section in [RFC7970]
IODEF-Document	version lang? format-id? private-enum-name? private-enum-id? Incident+ AdditionalData*	3.1
Incident	purpose ext-purpose? status? ext-status? lang? restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? IncidentID AlternativeID? RelatedActivity* DetectTime? StartTime? EndTime? RecoveryTime? ReportTime? GenerationTime Description* Discovery* Assessment* Method* Contact+ EventData* Indicator* History? AdditionalData*	3.2
IncidentID	id name instance? restriction? ext-restriction?	3.4

AlternativeID	restriction? ext-restriction? IncidentID+	3.5
RelatedActivity	restriction? ext-restriction? IncidentID* URL* ThreatActor* Campaign* IndicatorID* Confidence? Description* AdditionalData*	3.6
ThreatActor	restriction? ext-restriction? ThreatActorID* URL* Description* AdditionalData*	3.7
Campaign	restriction? ext-restriction? CampaignID* URL* Description* AdditionalData*	3.8
Contact	role ext-role? type ext-type? restriction? ext-restriction? ContactName* ContactTitle* Description* RegistryHandle* PostalAddress* Email* Telephone* Timezone? Contact* AdditionalData*	3.9
RegistryHandle	handle registry ext-registry?	3.9.1
PostalAddress	type? ext-type? PAddress Description*	3.9.2
Email	type? ext-type? EmailTo Description*	3.9.3
Telephone	type? ext-type? TelephoneNumber Description*	3.9.4
Discovery	source? ext-source? restriction? ext-restriction? Description* Contact*	3.10

	DetectionPattern*	
DetectionPattern	restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? Application Description* DetectionConfiguration*	3.10.1
Method	restriction? ext-restriction? Reference* Description* AttackPattern* Vulnerability* Weakness* AdditionalData*	3.11
Weakness	restriction? ext-restriction?	4.5.5 in [RFC7203]
Reference	observable-id? ReferenceName? URL* Description*	3.11.1
Assessment	occurrence? restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? IncidentCategory* SystemImpact* BusinessImpact* TimeImpact* MonetaryImpact* IntendedImpact* Counter* MitigatingFactor* Cause* Confidence? AdditionalData*	3.12
SystemImpact	severity? completion? type ext-type? Description*	3.12.1
BusinessImpact	severity? ext-severity? type ext-type? Description*	3.12.2
TimeImpact	value severity? metric ext-metric? duration? ext-duration?	3.12.3
MonetaryImpact	value severity? currency?	3.12.4
Confidence	value rating ext-rating?	3.12.5
History	restriction? ext-restriction?	3.13

	HistoryItem+	
HistoryItem	action ext-action? restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? DateTime IncidentID? Contact? Description* DefinedCOA* AdditionalData*	3.13.1
EventData	restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? Description* DetectTime? StartTime? EndTime? RecoveryTime? ReportTime? Contact* Discovery* Assessment? Method* System* Expectation* RecordData* EventData* AdditionalData*	3.14
Expectation	action? ext-action? severity? restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? Description* DefinedCOA* StartTime? EndTime? Contact?	3.15
System	category? ext-category? interface? spoofed? virtual? ownership? ext-ownership? restriction? ext-restriction? Node NodeRole* Service* OperatingSystem* Counter* AssetID* Description* AdditionalData*	3.17
Node	DomainData* Address* PostalAddress? Location* Counter*	3.18
Address	value category	3.18.1

	ext-category? vlan-name? vlan-num? observable-id?	
NodeRole	category ext-category? Description*	3.18.2
Counter	value type ext-type? unit ext-unit? meaning? duration? ext-duration?	3.18.3
DomainData	system-status ext-system-status? domain-status ext-domain-status? observable-id? Name DateDomainWasChecked? RegistrationDate? ExpirationDate? RelatedDNS* Nameservers* DomainContacts?	3.19
Nameservers	Server Address*	3.19.1
DomainContacts	SameDomainContact? Contact+	3.19.2
Service	ip-protocol? observable-id? ServiceName? Port? Portlist? ProtoCode? ProtoType? ProtoField? ApplicationHeaderField* EmailData? Application?	3.20
ServiceName	IANAService? URL* Description*	3.20.1
EmailData	observable-id? EmailTo* EmailFrom? EmailSubject? EmailX-Mailer? EmailHeaderField* EmailHeaders? EmailBody? EmailMessage? HashData* Signature*	3.21
RecordData	restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? DateTime? Description* Application?	3.22.1

	RecordPattern* RecordItem* URL* FileData* WindowsRegistryKeysModified* CertificateData* AdditionalData*	
RecordPattern	type ext-type? offset? offsetunit? ext-offsetunit? instance? value	3.22.2
WindowsRegistryKeysModified	observable-id? Key+	3.23
Key	registryaction? ext-registryaction? observable-id? KeyName KeyValue?	3.23.1
CertificateData	restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? Certificate+	3.24
Certificate	observable-id? X509Data Description*	3.24.1
FileData	restriction? ext-restriction? observable-id? File+	3.25
File	observable-id? FileName? FileSize? FileType? URL* HashData? Signature* AssociatedSoftware? FileProperties*	3.25.1
HashData	scope HashTargetID? Hash* FuzzyHash*	3.26
Hash	DigestMethod DigestValue CanonicalizationMethod? Application?	3.26.1
FuzzyHash	FuzzyHashValue+ Application? AdditionalData*	3.26.2
Indicator	restriction? ext-restriction? IndicatorID AlternativeIndicatorID* Description* StartTime? EndTime? Confidence?	3.29

	Contact* Observable? uid-ref? IndicatorExpression? IndicatorReference? NodeRole* AttackPhase* Reference* AdditionalData*	
IndicatorID	id name version	3.29.1
AlternativeIndicatorID	restriction? ext-restriction? IndicatorID+	3.29.2
Observable	restriction? ext-restriction? System? Address? DomainData? Service? EmailData? WindowsRegistryKeysModified? FileData? CertificateData? RegistryHandle? RecordData? EventData? Incident? Expectation? Reference? Assessment? DetectionPattern? HistoryItem? BulkObservable? AdditionalData*	3.29.3
BulkObservable	type? ext-type? BulkObservableFormat? BulkObservableList AdditionalData*	3.29.3.1
BulkObservableFormat	Hash? AdditionalData*	3.29.3.1.1
IndicatorExpression	operator? ext-operator? IndicatorExpression* Observable* uid-ref* IndicatorReference* Confidence? AdditionalData*	3.29.4
IndicatorReference	uid-ref? euid-ref? version?	3.29.7
AttackPhase	AttackPhaseID* URL* Description* AdditionalData*	3.29.8

Table 3: IODEF Classes

3.2. Mapping between JSON and XML IODEF

- * Attributes and elements of each class in the XML IODEF document are both presented as JSON attributes in the JSON IODEF document, and the order of their appearances is ignored.
- * Flow class is deleted, and classes with its instances now directly have instances of the EventData class that used to belong to the Flow class.
- * ApplicationHeader class is deleted, and classes with its instances now directly have instances of the ApplicationHeaderField class that used to belong to the ApplicationHeader class.
- * SignatureData class is deleted, and classes with its instances now directly have instances of the Signature class that used to belong to the SignatureData class.
- * IndicatorData class is deleted, and classes with its instances now directly have instances of the Indicator class that used to belong to the IndicatorData class.
- * ObservableReference class is deleted, and classes with its instances now directly have uid-ref as an element.
- * Record class is deleted, and classes with its instances now directly have instances of the RecordData class that used to belong to the Record class.
- * The MLStringType was modified to support simple string by allowing the type to have not only a predefined object type but also a text type, in order to allow simple descriptions of elements of the type. Implementations need to be capable of parsing an MLStringType that could take the form of both text and an object.
- * The elements of the ML_STRING type in the XML IODEF document are presented as either STRING type or ML_STRING type in the JSON IODEF document. When converting from the XML IODEF document to the JSON IODEF document, or vice versa, the information contained in the original data of the ML_STRING type must be preserved. When STRING is used instead of ML_STRING, parsers can assume that its "xml:lang" is set to "en".
- * Data models of the extension classes defined by [RFC7203] and referenced by [RFC7970] are represented by the STRUCTUREDINFO class defined in this document.
- * Signature, X509Data, and RawData are encoded using base64 encoding for JSON IODEF and binary representation for CBOR IODEF to represent them as BYTE objects.
- * EmailBody represents a whole message body including MIME structure in the same manner defined in [RFC7970]. In case of an email composed of a MIME multipart, the EmailBody contains multiple body parts separated by boundary strings.
- * The "ipv6-net-mask" type attribute of the BulkObservable class remains available for the purpose of backward compatibility, but the use of this attribute is not recommended because IPv6 does not use netmask any more.
- * ENUM values in this document are extensible and managed by IANA, which is also the case in [RFC7970]. The values in the table are used both by [RFC7970] implementations and by their JSON (and CBOR) bindings as specified by this document.
- * This document uses JSON's "number" type to represent integers that only have full precision for integer values between -2^{53} and 2^{53} . When dealing with integers outside the range, this issue needs to be considered.
- * Binaries are encoded in bytes. Note that XML IODEF in [RFC7970]

uses HEXBIN due to the incapability of XML for embedding binaries as they are.

4. Examples

This section provides examples of IODEF documents. These examples do not represent the full capabilities of the data model or the only way to encode particular information.

4.1. Minimal Example

A document containing only the mandatory elements and attributes is shown below in JSON and CBOR, respectively.

```
{
  "version": "2.0",
  "lang": "en",
  "Incident": [{
    "purpose": "reporting",
    "restriction": "private",
    "IncidentID": {
      "id": "492382",
      "name": "csirt.example.com"
    },
    "GenerationTime": "2015-07-18T09:00:00-05:00",
    "Contact": [{
      "type": "organization",
      "role": "creator",
      "Email": [{"EmailTo": "contact@csirt.example.com"}]
    }]
  }]
}
```

Figure 1: A Minimal Example in JSON

```
A3                                     # map(3)
37                                     # negative(23)
63                                     # text(3)
322E30                                # "2.0"
36                                     # negative(22)
62                                     # text(2)
656E                                    # "en"
32                                     # negative(18)
81                                     # array(1)
A5                                     # map(5)
21                                     # negative(1)
69                                     # text(9)
7265706F7274696E67                   # "reporting"
29                                     # negative(9)
67                                     # text(7)
70726976617465                       # "private"
02                                     # unsigned(2)
A2                                     # map(2)
12                                     # unsigned(18)
66                                     # text(6)
343932333832                         # "492382"
2E                                     # negative(14)
71                                     # text(17)
63736972742E6578616D706C652E636F6D  # "csirt.example.com"
0A                                     # unsigned(10)
78 19                                 # text(25)
323031352D30372D31385430393A30303A30302D30353A3030  # "2015-07-18T09:00:00
# -05:00"
0E                                     # unsigned(14)
81                                     # array(1)
A3                                     # map(3)
18 1C                                 # unsigned(28)
6C                                     # text(12)
6F7267616E697A6174696F6E # "organization"
```

```

18 1A          # unsigned(26)
67            # text(7)
  63726561746F72 # "creator"
18 22          # unsigned(34)
81            # array(1)
  A1          # map(1)
    18 29      # unsigned(41)
    78 19      # text(25)
      636F6E7461637444063736972742E6578616D70
      6C652E636F6D
          # "contact@csirt.example.com"

```

Figure 2: A Minimal Example in CBOR

4.2. Indicators from a Campaign

An example of C2 domains from a given campaign is shown below in JSON and CBOR, respectively.

```

{
  "version": "2.0",
  "lang": "en",
  "Incident": [{
    "purpose": "watch",
    "restriction": "green",
    "IncidentID": {
      "id": "897923",
      "name": "csirt.example.com"
    },
  }],
  "RelatedActivity": [{
    "ThreatActor": [{
      "ThreatActorID": ["TA-12-AGGRESSIVE-BUTTERFLY"],
      "Description": ["Aggressive Butterfly"]}],
    "Campaign": [{
      "CampaignID": ["C-2015-59405"],
      "Description": ["Orange Giraffe"]
    }]
  }],
  "GenerationTime": "2015-10-02T11:18:00-05:00",
  "Description": ["Summarizes the Indicators of Compromise for the Orange Giraffe campaign of the Aggressive Butterfly crime gang."],
  "Assessment": [{
    "Impact": [{"BusinessImpact": {"type": "breach-proprietary"}}]
  }],
  "Contact": [{
    "type": "organization",
    "role": "creator",
    "ContactName": ["CSIRT for example.com"],
    "Email": [{
      "EmailTo": "contact@csirt.example.com"
    }]
  }],
  "Indicator": [{
    "IndicatorID": {
      "id": "G90823490",
      "name": "csirt.example.com",
      "version": "1"
    },
    "Description": ["C2 domains"],
    "StartTime": "2014-12-02T11:18:00-05:00",
    "Observable": {
      "BulkObservable": {
        "type": "domain-name",
        "BulkObservableList": "kj290023j09r34.example.com"
      }
    }
  }],
}

```

Figure 3: Indicators from a Campaign in JSON

```

A3 # map(3)
37 # negative(23)
63 # text(3)
322E30 # "2.0"
36 # negative(22)
62 # text(2)
656E # "en"
32 # negative(18)
81 # array(1)
A9 # map(9)
21 # negative(1)
65 # text(5)
7761746368 # "watch"
29 # negative(9)
65 # text(5)
677265656E # "green"
02 # unsigned(2)
A2 # map(2)
12 # unsigned(18)
66 # text(6)
383937393233 # "897923"
2E # negative(14)
71 # text(17)
63736972742E6578616D706C652E636F6D # "csirt.example.com"
04 # unsigned(4)
81 # array(1)
A2 # map(2)
14 # unsigned(20)
81 # array(1)
A2 # map(2)
18 18 # unsigned(24)
81 # array(1)
78 1A # text(26)
54412D31322D414747524553534956452D4 # "TA-12-AGGRESSIVE"
25554544552464C59 # -BUTTERFLY"
24 # negative(4)
81 # array(1)
74 # text(20)
41676772657373697665204275747465726 # "Aggressive Butterfly"
66C79 # unsigned(21)
15 # array(1)
81 # map(2)
A2 # unsigned(25)
18 19 # array(1)
81 # text(12)
6C # text(12)
432D323031352D3539343035 # "C-2015-59405"
24 # negative(4)
81 # array(1)
6E # text(14)
4F72616E67652047697261666665
# "Orange Giraffe"
0A # unsigned(10)
78 19 # text(25)
323031352D31302D30325431313A31383A30302D30353A3030 # "2015-10-02T11:18:00-05:00"
24 # negative(4)
81 # array(1)
78 6F # text(111)
53756D6D6172697A65732074686520496E64696361746F7 # "Summarizes the Indicators"
273206F6620436F6D70726F6D69736520666F7220746865
204F72616E676520476972616666652063616D706169676
E206F662074686520416767726573736976652042757474
6572666C79206372696D652067616E672E

```



```

# of Compromise for the
# Orange Giraffe campaign
# of the Aggressive
# Butterfly crime gang."
0C # unsigned(12)
81 # array(1)
  A1 # map(1)
    18 3F # unsigned(63)
    81 # array(1)
      A1 # map(1)
        18 41 # unsigned(65)
        A1 # map(1)
          18 1C # unsigned(28)
          72 # text(18)
            6272656163682D70726F7072696574617279
0E # "breach-proprietary"
81 # unsigned(14)
  A4 # array(1)
    18 1C # map(4)
    6C # unsigned(28)
      6F7267616E697A6174696F6E # text(12)
        # "organization"
    18 1A # unsigned(26)
    67 # text(7)
      63726561746F72 # "creator"
    18 1E # unsigned(30)
    81 # array(1)
      75 # text(21)
        435349525420666F72206578616D706C652E636F6D
        # "CSIRT for example.com"
    18 22 # unsigned(34)
    81 # array(1)
      A1 # map(1)
        18 29 # unsigned(41)
        78 19 # text(25)
          636F6E746163744063736972742E6578616D70
          6C652E636F6D
          # "contact@csirt.example.com"
10 # unsigned(16)
81 # array(1)
  A4 # map(4)
    16 # unsigned(22)
    A3 # map(3)
      12 # unsigned(18)
      69 # text(9)
        473930383233343930 # "G90823490"
      2E # negative(14)
      71 # text(17)
        63736972742E6578616D706C652E636F6D
        # "csirt.example.com"
      37 # negative(23)
      61 # text(1)
        31 # "1"
      24 # negative(4)
      81 # array(1)
        6A # text(10)
          433220646F6D61696E73 # "C2 domains"
      06 # unsigned(6)
      78 19 # text(25)
        323031342D31322D30325431313A31383A30302D30353A3030
        # "2014-12-02T11:18:00-05:00"
    18 AB # unsigned(171)
    A1 # map(1)
      18 B0 # unsigned(176)
      A2 # map(2)
        18 1C # unsigned(28)
        6B # text(11)
          646F6D61696E2D6E616D65
          # "domain-name"
        18 B2 # unsigned(178)

```

```

78 1A # text(26)
6B6A32393030323336A30397233342E6578616D
706C652E636F6D
# "kj290023j09r34.example.com"

```

Figure 4: Indicators from a Campaign in CBOR

5. Mapkeys

The mapkeys are provided in Table 4 for minimizing the CBOR size.

mapkey	cborkey
iodef-version	-24
iodef-lang	-23
iodef-format-id	-22
iodef-private-enum-name	-21
iodef-private-enum-id	-20
iodef-Incident	-19
iodef-AdditionalData	-18
iodef-value	-17
iodef-translation-id	-16
iodef-name	-15
iodef-dtype	-14
iodef-ext-dtype	-13
iodef-meaning	-12
iodef-formatid	-11
iodef-restriction	-10
iodef-ext-restriction	-9
iodef-observable-id	-8
iodef-SoftwareReference	-7
iodef-URL	-6
iodef-Description	-5
iodef-spec-name	-4
iodef-ext-spec-name	-3
iodef-purpose	-2
iodef-ext-purpose	-1
iodef-status	0
iodef-ext-status	1
iodef-IncidentID	2
iodef-AlternativeID	3
iodef-RelatedActivity	4

iodef-DetectTime	5
iodef-StartTime	6
iodef-EndTime	7
iodef-RecoveryTime	8
iodef-ReportTime	9
iodef-GenerationTime	10
iodef-Discovery	11
iodef-Assessment	12
iodef-Method	13
iodef-Contact	14
iodef-EventData	15
iodef-Indicator	16
iodef-History	17
iodef-id	18
iodef-instance	19
iodef-ThreatActor	20
iodef-Campaign	21
iodef-IndicatorID	22
iodef-Confidence	23
iodef-ThreatActorID	24
iodef-CampaignID	25
iodef-role	26
iodef-ext-role	27
iodef-type	28
iodef-ext-type	29
iodef-ContactName	30
iodef-ContactTitle	31
iodef-RegistryHandle	32
iodef-PostalAddress	33
iodef-Email	34
iodef-Telephone	35
iodef-Timezone	36
iodef-handle	37
iodef-registry	38
iodef-ext-registry	39

iodef-PAddress	40
iodef-EmailTo	41
iodef-TelephoneNumber	42
iodef-source	43
iodef-ext-source	44
iodef-DetectionPattern	45
iodef-DetectionConfiguration	46
iodef-Application	47
iodef-Reference	48
iodef-AttackPattern	49
iodef-Vulnerability	50
iodef-Weakness	51
iodef-SpecID	52
iodef-ext-SpecID	53
iodef-ContentID	54
iodef-RawData	55
iodef-Platform	56
iodef-Scoring	57
iodef-ReferenceName	58
iodef-specIndex	59
iodef-ID	60
iodef-occurrence	61
iodef-IncidentCategory	62
iodef-Impact	63
iodef-SystemImpact	64
iodef-BusinessImpact	65
iodef-TimeImpact	66
iodef-MonetaryImpact	67
iodef-IntendedImpact	68
iodef-Counter	69
iodef-MitigatingFactor	70
iodef-Cause	71
iodef-severity	72
iodef-completion	73
iodef-ext-severity	74
iodef-metric	75

iodef-ext-metric	76
iodef-duration	77
iodef-ext-duration	78
iodef-currency	79
iodef-rating	80
iodef-ext-rating	81
iodef-HistoryItem	82
iodef-action	83
iodef-ext-action	84
iodef-DateTime	85
iodef-DefinedCOA	86
iodef-System	87
iodef-Expectation	88
iodef-RecordData	89
iodef-category	90
iodef-ext-category	91
iodef-interface	92
iodef-spoofed	93
iodef-virtual	94
iodef-ownership	95
iodef-ext-ownership	96
iodef-Node	97
iodef-NodeRole	98
iodef-Service	99
iodef-OperatingSystem	100
iodef-AssetID	101
iodef-DomainData	102
iodef-Address	103
iodef-Location	104
iodef-vlan-name	105
iodef-vlan-num	106
iodef-unit	107
iodef-ext-unit	108
iodef-system-status	109
iodef-ext-system-status	110

iodef-domain-status	111
iodef-ext-domain-status	112
iodef-Name	113
iodef-DateDomainWasChecked	114
iodef-RegistrationDate	115
iodef-ExpirationDate	116
iodef-RelatedDNS	117
iodef-NameServers	118
iodef-DomainContacts	119
iodef-Server	120
iodef-SameDomainContact	121
iodef-ip-protocol	122
iodef-ServiceName	123
iodef-Port	124
iodef-Portlist	125
iodef-ProtoCode	126
iodef-ProtoType	127
iodef-ProtoField	128
iodef-ApplicationHeaderField	129
iodef-EmailData	130
iodef-IANAService	131
iodef-EmailFrom	132
iodef-EmailSubject	133
iodef-EmailX-Mailer	134
iodef-EmailHeaderField	135
iodef-EmailHeaders	136
iodef-EmailBody	137
iodef-EmailMessage	138
iodef-HashData	139
iodef-Signature	140
iodef-RecordPattern	141
iodef-RecordItem	142
iodef-FileData	143
iodef-WindowsRegistryKeysModified	144
iodef-CertificateData	145
iodef-offset	146

iodef-offsetunit	147
iodef-ext-offsetunit	148
iodef-Key	149
iodef-registryaction	150
iodef-ext-registryaction	151
iodef-KeyName	152
iodef-KeyValue	153
iodef-Certificate	154
iodef-X509Data	155
iodef-File	156
iodef-FileName	157
iodef-FileSize	158
iodef-FileType	159
iodef-AssociatedSoftware	160
iodef-FileProperties	161
iodef-scope	162
iodef-HashTargetID	163
iodef-Hash	164
iodef-FuzzyHash	165
iodef-DigestMethod	166
iodef-DigestValue	167
iodef-CanonicalizationMethod	168
iodef-FuzzyHashValue	169
iodef-AlternativeIndicatorID	170
iodef-Observable	171
iodef-uid-ref	172
iodef-IndicatorExpression	173
iodef-IndicatorReference	174
iodef-AttackPhase	175
iodef-BulkObservable	176
iodef-BulkObservableFormat	177
iodef-BulkObservableList	178
iodef-operator	179
iodef-ext-operator	180
iodef-euid-ref	181

Table 4: Mapkeys

6. The IODEF Data Model (CDDL)

This section provides the IODEF data model. Note that mapkeys are described at the beginning of the CDDL data model for better readability.

```
start = iodef

;;; iodef.json: IODEF-Document

iodef-version = -24
iodef-lang = -23
iodef-format-id = -22
iodef-private-enum-name = -21
iodef-private-enum-id = -20
iodef-Incident = -19
iodef-AdditionalData = -18
iodef-value = -17
iodef-translation-id = -16
iodef-name = -15
iodef-dtype = -14
iodef-ext-dtype = -13
iodef-meaning = -12
iodef-formatid = -11
iodef-restriction = -10
iodef-ext-restriction = -9
iodef-observable-id = -8
iodef-SoftwareReference = -7
iodef-URL = -6
iodef-Description = -5
iodef-spec-name = -4
iodef-ext-spec-name = -3
iodef-purpose = -2
iodef-ext-purpose = -1
iodef-status = 0
iodef-ext-status = 1
iodef-IncidentID = 2
iodef-AlternativeID = 3
iodef-RelatedActivity = 4
iodef-DetectTime = 5
iodef-StartTime = 6
iodef-EndTime = 7
iodef-RecoveryTime = 8
iodef-ReportTime = 9
iodef-GenerationTime = 10
iodef-Discovery = 11
iodef-Assessment = 12
iodef-Method = 13
iodef-Contact = 14
iodef-EventData = 15
iodef-Indicator = 16
iodef-History = 17
iodef-id = 18
iodef-instance = 19
iodef-ThreatActor = 20
iodef-Campaign = 21
iodef-IndicatorID = 22
iodef-Confidence = 23
iodef-ThreatActorID = 24
iodef-CampaignID = 25
iodef-role = 26
iodef-ext-role = 27
iodef-type = 28
iodef-ext-type = 29
iodef-ContactName = 30
iodef-ContactTitle = 31
```


iodef-RegistryHandle = 32
iodef-PostalAddress = 33
iodef-Email = 34
iodef-Telephone = 35
iodef-Timezone = 36
iodef-handle = 37
iodef-registry = 38
iodef-ext-registry = 39
iodef-PAddress = 40
iodef-EmailTo = 41
iodef-TelephoneNumber = 42
iodef-source = 43
iodef-ext-source = 44
iodef-DetectionPattern = 45
iodef-DetectionConfiguration = 46
iodef-Application = 47
iodef-Reference = 48
iodef-AttackPattern = 49
iodef-Vulnerability = 50
iodef-Weakness = 51
iodef-SpecID = 52
iodef-ext-SpecID = 53
iodef-ContentID = 54
iodef-RawData = 55
iodef-Platform = 56
iodef-Scoring = 57
iodef-ReferenceName = 58
iodef-specIndex = 59
iodef-ID = 60
iodef-occurrence = 61
iodef-IncidentCategory = 62
iodef-Impact = 63
iodef-SystemImpact = 64
iodef-BusinessImpact = 65
iodef-TimeImpact = 66
iodef-MonetaryImpact = 67
iodef-IntendedImpact = 68
iodef-Counter = 69
iodef-MitigatingFactor = 70
iodef-Cause = 71
iodef-severity = 72
iodef-completion = 73
iodef-ext-severity = 74
iodef-metric = 75
iodef-ext-metric = 76
iodef-duration = 77
iodef-ext-duration = 78
iodef-currency = 79
iodef-rating = 80
iodef-ext-rating = 81
iodef-HistoryItem = 82
iodef-action = 83
iodef-ext-action = 84
iodef-DateTime = 85
iodef-DefinedCOA = 86
iodef-System = 87
iodef-Expectation = 88
iodef-RecordData = 89
iodef-category = 90
iodef-ext-category = 91
iodef-interface = 92
iodef-spoofed = 93
iodef-virtual = 94
iodef-ownership = 95
iodef-ext-ownership = 96
iodef-Node = 97
iodef-NodeRole = 98
iodef-Service = 99
iodef-OperatingSystem = 100
iodef-AssetID = 101
iodef-DomainData = 102

iodef-Address = 103
iodef-Location = 104
iodef-vlan-name = 105
iodef-vlan-num = 106
iodef-unit = 107
iodef-ext-unit = 108
iodef-system-status = 109
iodef-ext-system-status = 110
iodef-domain-status = 111
iodef-ext-domain-status = 112
iodef-Name = 113
iodef-DateDomainWasChecked = 114
iodef-RegistrationDate = 115
iodef-ExpirationDate = 116
iodef-RelatedDNS = 117
iodef-NameServers = 118
iodef-DomainContacts = 119
iodef-Server = 120
iodef-SameDomainContact = 121
iodef-ip-protocol = 122
iodef-ServiceName = 123
iodef-Port = 124
iodef-Portlist = 125
iodef-ProtoCode = 126
iodef-ProtoType = 127
iodef-ProtoField = 128
iodef-ApplicationHeaderField = 129
iodef-EmailData = 130
iodef-IANAService = 131
iodef-EmailFrom = 132
iodef-EmailSubject = 133
iodef-EmailX-Mailer = 134
iodef-EmailHeaderField = 135
iodef-EmailHeaders = 136
iodef-EmailBody = 137
iodef-EmailMessage = 138
iodef-HashData = 139
iodef-Signature = 140
iodef-RecordPattern = 141
iodef-RecordItem = 142
iodef-FileData = 143
iodef-WindowsRegistryKeysModified = 144
iodef-CertificateData = 145
iodef-offset = 146
iodef-offsetunit = 147
iodef-ext-offsetunit = 148
iodef-Key = 149
iodef-registryaction = 150
iodef-ext-registryaction = 151
iodef-KeyName = 152
iodef-KeyValue = 153
iodef-Certificate = 154
iodef-X509Data = 155
iodef-File = 156
iodef-FileName = 157
iodef-FileSize = 158
iodef-FileType = 159
iodef-AssociatedSoftware = 160
iodef-FileProperties = 161
iodef-scope = 162
iodef-HashTargetID = 163
iodef-Hash = 164
iodef-FuzzyHash = 165
iodef-DigestMethod = 166
iodef-DigestValue = 167
iodef-CanonicalizationMethod = 168
iodef-FuzzyHashValue = 169
iodef-AlternativeIndicatorID = 170
iodef-Observable = 171
iodef-uid-ref = 172
iodef-IndicatorExpression = 173

```
iodef-IndicatorReference = 174
iodef-AttackPhase = 175
iodef-BulkObservable = 176
iodef-BulkObservableFormat = 177
iodef-BulkObservableList = 178
iodef-operator = 179
iodef-ext-operator = 180
iodef-euid-ref = 181
iodef-AttackPhaseID = 182
```

```
iodef = {
  iodef-version => text,
  ? iodef-lang => lang,
  ? iodef-format-id => text
  ? iodef-private-enum-name => text,
  ? iodef-private-enum-id => text,
  iodef-Incident => [+ Incident],
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}
```

```
duration = "second" / "minute" / "hour" / "day" / "month" /
"quarter" / "year" / "ext-value"
lang = "" / text .regexp "[a-zA-Z]{1,8}(-[a-zA-Z0-9]{1,8})*"
```

```
restriction = "public" / "partner" / "need-to-know" / "private" /
"default" / "white" / "green" / "amber" / "red" /
"ext-value"
```

```
SpecID = "urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:mile:mndef:1.2" / "private"
```

```
IDtype = text .regexp "[a-zA-Z_][a-zA-Z0-9_-]*"
```

```
IDREFType = IDtype
```

```
URLtype = uri
```

```
TimeZonetype = text .regexp "Z|[\+\-](0[0-9]|1[0-4]):[0-5][0-9]"
```

```
PortlistType = text .regexp
```

```
"[0-9]+(\-[0-9]+)?(,[0-9]+(\-[0-9]+)?)*"
```

```
action = "nothing" / "contact-source-site" / "contact-target-site" /
"contact-sender" / "investigate" / "block-host" /
"block-network" / "block-port" / "rate-limit-host" /
"rate-limit-network" / "rate-limit-port" / "redirect-traffic" /
"honey-pot" / "upgrade-software" / "rebuild-asset" /
"hardening-asset" / "remediate-other" / "status-triage" /
"status-new-info" / "watch-and-report" / "training" /
"defined-coa" / "other" / "ext-value"
```

```
DATETIME = tdate
```

```
BYTE = eb64legacy
```

```
MLStringType = {
  iodef-value => text,
  ? iodef-lang => lang,
  ? iodef-translation-id => text
} / text
```

```
PositiveFloatType = float32 .gt 0
```

```
PAddressType = MLStringType
```

```
ExtensionType = {
  iodef-value => text,
  ? iodef-name => text,
  iodef-dtype => "boolean" / "byte" / "bytes" / "character" /
"date-time" / "ntpstamp" / "integer" / "portlist" / "real" /
"string" / "file" / "path" / "frame" / "packet" / "ipv4-packet" /
"json" / "ipv6-packet" / "url" / "csv" / "winreg" / "xml" /
"ext-value"
.default "string"
  ? iodef-ext-dtype => text,
  ? iodef-meaning => text,
  ? iodef-formatid => text,
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
```

```
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,  
}
```

```
SoftwareType = {  
  ? iodef-SoftwareReference => SoftwareReference,  
  ? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],  
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]  
}
```

```
SoftwareReference = {  
  ? iodef-value => text,  
  iodef-spec-name => "custom" / "cpe" / "swid" / "ext-value",  
  ? iodef-ext-spec-name => text,  
  ? iodef-dtype => "bytes" / "integer" / "real" / "string" / "xml" /  
  "ext-value" .default "string",  
  ? iodef-ext-dtype => text  
}
```

```
Incident = {  
  iodef-purpose => "traceback" / "mitigation" / "reporting" /  
  "watch" / "other" / "ext-value",  
  ? iodef-ext-purpose => text,  
  ? iodef-status => "new" / "in-progress" / "forwarded" / "resolved" /  
  "future" / "ext-value",  
  ? iodef-ext-status => text,  
  ? iodef-lang => lang,  
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",  
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,  
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,  
  iodef-IncidentID => IncidentID,  
  ? iodef-AlternativeID => AlternativeID,  
  ? iodef-RelatedActivity => [+ RelatedActivity],  
  ? iodef-DetectTime => DATETIME,  
  ? iodef-StartTime => DATETIME,  
  ? iodef-EndTime => DATETIME,  
  ? iodef-RecoveryTime => DATETIME,  
  ? iodef-ReportTime => DATETIME,  
  iodef-GenerationTime => DATETIME,  
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],  
  ? iodef-Discovery => [+ Discovery],  
  ? iodef-Assessment => [+ Assessment],  
  ? iodef-Method => [+ Method],  
  iodef-Contact => [+ Contact],  
  ? iodef-EventData => [+ EventData],  
  ? iodef-Indicator => [+ Indicator],  
  ? iodef-History => History,  
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]  
}
```

```
IncidentID = {  
  iodef-id => text,  
  iodef-name => text,  
  ? iodef-instance => text,  
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",  
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text  
}
```

```
AlternativeID = {  
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",  
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,  
  iodef-IncidentID => [+ IncidentID]  
}
```

```
RelatedActivity = {  
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",  
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,  
  ? iodef-IncidentID => [+ IncidentID],  
  ? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],  
  ? iodef-ThreatActor => [+ ThreatActor],  
  ? iodef-Campaign => [+ Campaign],  
  ? iodef-IndicatorID => [+ IndicatorID],  
}
```

```

? iodef-Confidence => Confidence,
? iodef-Description => [+ text],
? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

ThreatActor = {
? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
? iodef-ThreatActorID => [+ text],
? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

Campaign = {
? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
? iodef-CampaignID => [+ text],
? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

Contact = {
  iodef-role => "creator" / "reporter" / "admin" / "tech" /
"provider" / "user" / "billing" / "legal" / "irt" / "abuse" /
"cc" / "cc-irt" / "leo" / "vendor" / "vendor-support" /
"victim" / "victim-notified" / "ext-value",
? iodef-ext-role => text,
  iodef-type => "person" / "organization" / "ext-value",
? iodef-ext-type => text,
? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
? iodef-ContactName => [+ MLStringType],
? iodef-ContactTitle => [+ MLStringType],
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
? iodef-RegistryHandle => [+ RegistryHandle],
? iodef-PostalAddress => [+ PostalAddress],
? iodef-Email => [+ Email],
? iodef-Telephone => [+ Telephone],
? iodef-Timezone => TimeZonetype,
? iodef-Contact => [+ Contact],
? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

RegistryHandle = {
  iodef-handle => text,
  iodef-registry => "internic" / "apnic" / "arin" / "lacnic" /
"ripe" / "afrinic" / "local" / "ext-value",
? iodef-ext-registry => text
}

PostalAddress = {
? iodef-type => "street" / "mailing" / "ext-value",
? iodef-ext-type => text,
  iodef-PAddress => PAddressType,
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

Email = {
? iodef-type => "direct" / "hotline" / "ext-value",
? iodef-ext-type => text,
  iodef-EmailTo => text,
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

Telephone = {
? iodef-type => "wired" / "mobile" / "fax" / "hotline" /
"ext-value",
? iodef-ext-type => text,
  iodef-TelephoneNumber => text,

```

```

? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

Discovery = {
? iodef-source => "nidsps" / "hips" / "siem" / "av" /
"third-party-monitoring" / "incident" / "os-log" /
"application-log" / "device-log" / "network-flow" /
"passive-dns" / "investigation" / "audit" /
"internal-notification" / "external-notification" /
"leo" / "partner" / "actor" / "unknown" / "ext-value",
? iodef-ext-source => text,
? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
? iodef-Contact => [+ Contact],
? iodef-DetectionPattern => [+ DetectionPattern]
}

DetectionPattern = {
? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
(iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType] //
    iodef-DetectionConfiguration => [+ text]),
iodef-Application => SoftwareType
}

Method = {
? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
? iodef-Reference => [+ Reference],
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
? iodef-AttackPattern => [+ STRUCTUREDINFO],
? iodef-Vulnerability => [+ STRUCTUREDINFO],
? iodef-Weakness => [+ STRUCTUREDINFO],
? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

STRUCTUREDINFO = {
iodef-SpecID => SpecID,
? iodef-ext-SpecID => text,
? iodef-ContentID => text,
? (iodef-RawData => [+ BYTE] // iodef-Reference => [+ Reference]),
? iodef-Platform => [+ Platform],
? iodef-Scoring => [+ Scoring]
}

Platform = {
    iodef-SpecID => SpecID,
    ? iodef-ext-SpecID => text,
    ? iodef-ContentID => text,
    ? iodef-RawData => [+ BYTE],
    ? iodef-Reference => [+ Reference]
}

Scoring = {
    iodef-SpecID => SpecID,
    ? iodef-ext-SpecID => text,
    ? iodef-ContentID => text,
    ? iodef-RawData => [+ BYTE],
    ? iodef-Reference => [+ Reference]
}

Reference = {
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
? iodef-ReferenceName => ReferenceName,
? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

ReferenceName = {
iodef-specIndex => integer,
iodef-ID => IDtype
}

```

```

}

Assessment = {
  ? iodef-occurrence => "actual" / "potential",
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  ? iodef-IncidentCategory => [+ MLStringType],
  iodef-Impact => [+ {iodef-SystemImpact => SystemImpact} /
    {iodef-BusinessImpact => BusinessImpact} /
    {iodef-TimeImpact => TimeImpact} /
    {iodef-MonetaryImpact => MonetaryImpact} /
    {iodef-IntendedImpact => BusinessImpact}],
  ? iodef-Counter => [+ Counter],
  ? iodef-MitigatingFactor => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-Cause => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-Confidence => Confidence,
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

SystemImpact = {
  ? iodef-severity => "low" / "medium" / "high",
  ? iodef-completion => "failed" / "succeeded",
  iodef-type => "takeover-account" / "takeover-service" /
"takeover-system" / "cps-manipulation" / "cps-damage" /
"availability-data" / "availability-account" /
"availability-service" / "availability-system" / "damaged-system" /
"damaged-data" / "breach-proprietary" / "breach-privacy" /
"breach-credential" / "breach-configuration" / "integrity-data" /
"integrity-configuration" / "integrity-hardware" /
"traffic-redirection" / "monitoring-traffic" / "monitoring-host" /
"policy" / "unknown" / "ext-value" .default "unknown",
  ? iodef-ext-type => text,
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

BusinessImpact = {
  ? iodef-severity => "none" / "low" / "medium" / "high" / "unknown" /
"ext-value" .default "unknown",
  ? iodef-ext-severity => text,
  iodef-type => "breach-proprietary" / "breach-privacy" /
"breach-credential" / "loss-of-integrity" / "loss-of-service" /
"theft-financial" / "theft-service" / "degraded-reputation" /
"asset-damage" / "asset-manipulation" / "legal" / "extortion" /
"unknown" / "ext-value" .default "unknown",
  ? iodef-ext-type => text,
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

TimeImpact = {
  iodef-value => PositiveFloatType,
  ? iodef-severity => "low" / "medium" / "high",
  iodef-metric => "labor" / "elapsed" / "downtime" / "ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-metric => text,
  ? iodef-duration => duration .default "hour",
  ? iodef-ext-duration => text
}

MonetaryImpact = {
  iodef-value => PositiveFloatType,
  ? iodef-severity => "low" / "medium" / "high",
  ? iodef-currency => text
}

Confidence = {
  iodef-value => float32,
  iodef-rating => "low" / "medium" / "high" / "numeric" / "unknown" /
"ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-rating => text
}

```

```
History = {
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  iodef-HistoryItem => [+ HistoryItem]
}
```

```
HistoryItem = {
  iodef-action => action .default "other",
  ? iodef-ext-action => text,
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  iodef-DateTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-IncidentID => IncidentID,
  ? iodef-Contact => Contact,
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-DefinedCOA => [+ text],
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}
```

```
EventData = {
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "default",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-DetectTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-StartTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-EndTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-RecoveryTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-ReportTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-Contact => [+ Contact],
  ? iodef-Discovery => [+ Discovery],
  ? iodef-Assessment => Assessment,
  ? iodef-Method => [+ Method],
  ? iodef-System => [+ System],
  ? iodef-Expectation => [+ Expectation],
  ? iodef-RecordData => [+ RecordData],
  ? iodef-EventData => [+ EventData],
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}
```

```
Expectation = {
  ? iodef-action => action .default "other",
  ? iodef-ext-action => text,
  ? iodef-severity => "low" / "medium" / "high",
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "default",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-DefinedCOA => [+ text],
  ? iodef-StartTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-EndTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-Contact => Contact
}
```

```
System = {
  ? iodef-category => "source" / "target" / "intermediate" /
"sensor" / "infrastructure" / "ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-category => text,
  ? iodef-interface => text,
  ? iodef-spoofed => "unknown" / "yes" / "no" .default "unknown",
  ? iodef-virtual => "yes" / "no" / "unknown" .default "unknown",
  ? iodef-ownership => "organization" / "personal" / "partner" /
"customer" / "no-relationship" / "unknown" / "ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-ownership => text,
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  iodef-Node => Node,
  ? iodef-NodeRole => [+ NodeRole],
  ? iodef-Service => [+ Service],
}
```



```

? iodef-OperatingSystem => [+ SoftwareType],
? iodef-Counter => [+ Counter],
? iodef-AssetID => [+ text],
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

```

```

Node = {
  (iodef-DomainData => [+ DomainData] //
    iodef-Address => [+ Address]),
  ? iodef-PostalAddress => PostalAddress,
  ? iodef-Location => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-Counter => [+ Counter]
}

```

```

Address = {
  iodef-value => text,
  iodef-category => "asn" / "atm" / "e-mail" / "ipv4-addr" /
"ipv4-net" / "ipv4-net-masked" / "ipv4-net-mask" / "ipv6-addr" /
"ipv6-net" / "ipv6-net-masked" / "mac" / "site-uri" /
"ext-value" .default "ipv6-addr",
  ? iodef-ext-category => text,
  ? iodef-vlan-name => text,
  ? iodef-vlan-num => integer,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype
}

```

```

NodeRole = {
  iodef-category => "client" / "client-enterprise" /
"client-partner" / "client-remote" / "client-kiosk" /
"client-mobile" / "server-internal" / "server-public" /
"www" / "mail" / "webmail" / "messaging" / "streaming" /
"voice" / "file" / "ftp" / "p2p" / "name" / "directory" /
"credential" / "print" / "application" / "database" /
"backup" / "dhcp" / "assessment" / "source-control" /
"config-management" / "monitoring" / "infra" / "infra-firewall" /
"infra-router" / "infra-switch" / "camera" / "proxy" /
"remote-access" / "log" / "virtualization" / "pos" / "scada" /
"scada-supervisory" / "sinkhole" / "honeypot" /
"anonymization" / "c2-server" / "malware-distribution" /
"drop-server" / "hop-point" / "reflector" /
"phishing-site" / "spear-phishing-site" / "recruiting-site" /
"fraudulent-site" / "ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-category => text,
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

```

```

Counter = {
  iodef-value => float32,
  iodef-type => "count" / "peak" / "average" / "ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-type => text,
  iodef-unit => "byte" / "mbit" / "packet" / "flow" / "session" /
"alert" / "message" / "event" / "host" / "site" / "organization" /
"ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-unit => text,
  ? iodef-meaning => text,
  ? iodef-duration => duration .default "hour",
  ? iodef-ext-duration => text
}

```

```

DomainData = {
  iodef-system-status => "spoofed" / "fraudulent" /
"innocent-hacked" / "innocent-hijacked" / "unknown" / "ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-system-status => text,
  iodef-domain-status => "reservedDelegation" / "assignedAndActive" /
"assignedAndInactive" / "assignedAndOnHold" /
"revoked" / "transferPending" / "registryLock" /
"registrarLock" / "other" / "unknown" / "ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-domain-status => text,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  iodef-Name => text,
}

```

```

? iodef-DateDomainWasChecked => DATETIME,
? iodef-RegistrationDate => DATETIME,
? iodef-ExpirationDate => DATETIME,
? iodef-RelatedDNS => [+ ExtensionType],
? iodef-NameServers => [+ NameServers],
? iodef-DomainContacts => DomainContacts
}

NameServers = {
  iodef-Server => text,
  iodef-Address => [+ Address]
}

DomainContacts = {
  (iodef-SameDomainContact => text // iodef-Contact => [+ Contact])
}

Service = {
  ? iodef-ip-protocol => integer,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  ? iodef-ServiceName => ServiceName,
  ? iodef-Port => integer,
  ? iodef-Portlist => PortlistType,
  ? iodef-ProtoCode => integer,
  ? iodef-ProtoType => integer,
  ? iodef-ProtoField => integer,
  ? iodef-ApplicationHeaderField => [+ ExtensionType],
  ? iodef-EmailData => EmailData,
  ? iodef-Application => SoftwareType
}

ServiceName = {
  ? iodef-IANAService => text,
  ? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

EmailData = {
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  ? iodef-EmailTo => [+ text],
  ? iodef-EmailFrom => text,
  ? iodef-EmailSubject => text,
  ? iodef-EmailX-Mailer => text,
  ? iodef-EmailHeaderField => [+ ExtensionType],
  ? iodef-EmailHeaders => text,
  ? iodef-EmailBody => text,
  ? iodef-EmailMessage => text,
  ? iodef-HashData => [+ HashData],
  ? iodef-Signature => [+ BYTE]
}

RecordData = {
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  ? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
  ? iodef-DateTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-Application => SoftwareType,
  ? iodef-RecordPattern => [+ RecordPattern],
  ? iodef-RecordItem => [+ ExtensionType],
  ? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],
  ? iodef-FileData => [+ FileData],
  ? iodef-WindowsRegistryKeysModified =>
      [+ WindowsRegistryKeysModified],
  ? iodef-CertificateData => [+ CertificateData],
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

RecordPattern = {
  iodef-value => text,
  iodef-type => "regex" / "binary" / "xpath" /

```

```

"ext-value" .default "regex",
? iodef-ext-type => text,
? iodef-offset => integer,
? iodef-offsetunit => "line" / "byte" /
"ext-value" .default "line",
? iodef-ext-offsetunit => text,
? iodef-instance => integer
}

```

```

WindowsRegistryKeysModified = {
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
iodef-Key => [+ Key]
}

```

```

Key = {
? iodef-registryaction => "add-key" / "add-value" / "delete-key" /
"delete-value" / "modify-key" / "modify-value" /
"ext-value",
? iodef-ext-registryaction => text,
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
iodef-KeyName => text,
? iodef-KeyValue => text
}

```

```

CertificateData = {
? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
iodef-Certificate => [+ Certificate]
}

```

```

Certificate = {
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
iodef-X509Data => BYTE,
? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType]
}

```

```

FileData = {
? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
iodef-File => [+ File]
}

```

```

File = {
? iodef-observable-id => IDtype,
? iodef-FileName => text,
? iodef-FileSize => integer,
? iodef-FileType => text,
? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],
? iodef-HashData => HashData,
? iodef-Signature => [+ BYTE],
? iodef-AssociatedSoftware => SoftwareType,
? iodef-FileProperties => [+ ExtensionType]
}

```

```

HashData = {
iodef-scope => "file-contents" / "file-pe-section" /
"file-pe-iat" / "file-pe-resource" / "file-pdf-object" /
"email-hash" / "email-headers-hash" / "email-body-hash" /
"ext-value",
? iodef-HashTargetID => text,
? iodef-Hash => [+ Hash],
? iodef-FuzzyHash => [+ FuzzyHash]
}

```

```

Hash = {
iodef-DigestMethod => BYTE,
iodef-DigestValue => BYTE,
? iodef-CanonicalizationMethod => BYTE,
? iodef-Application => SoftwareType
}

```

```

}

FuzzyHash = {
  iodef-FuzzyHashValue => [+ ExtensionType],
  ? iodef-Application => SoftwareType,
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

Indicator = {
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  iodef-IndicatorID => IndicatorID,
  ? iodef-AlternativeIndicatorID => [+ AlternativeIndicatorID],
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-StartTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-EndTime => DATETIME,
  ? iodef-Confidence => Confidence,
  ? iodef-Contact => [+ Contact],
  (iodef-Observable => Observable // iodef-uid-ref => IDREFType //
  iodef-IndicatorExpression => IndicatorExpression //
  iodef-IndicatorReference => IndicatorReference),
  ? iodef-NodeRole => [+ NodeRole],
  ? iodef-AttackPhase => [+ AttackPhase],
  ? iodef-Reference => [+ Reference],
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

IndicatorID = {
  iodef-id => IDtype,
  iodef-name => text,
  iodef-version => text
}

AlternativeIndicatorID = {
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  iodef-IndicatorID => [+ IndicatorID]
}

Observable = {
  ? iodef-restriction => restriction .default "private",
  ? iodef-ext-restriction => text,
  ? (iodef-System => System // iodef-Address => Address //
  iodef-DomainData => DomainData //
  iodef-EmailData => EmailData //
  iodef-Service => Service //
  iodef-WindowsRegistryKeysModified =>
      WindowsRegistryKeysModified //
  iodef-FileData => FileData // iodef-CertificateData =>
      CertificateData //
  iodef-RegistryHandle => RegistryHandle // iodef-RecordData =>
      RecordData //
  iodef-EventData => EventData // iodef-Incident => Incident //
  iodef-Expectation => Expectation // iodef-Reference =>
      Reference //
  iodef-Assessment => Assessment //
  iodef-DetectionPattern => DetectionPattern //
  iodef-HistoryItem => HistoryItem //
  iodef-BulkObservable => BulkObservable //
  iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType])
}

BulkObservable = {
  ? iodef-type => "asn" / "atm" / "e-mail" / "ipv4-addr" /
  "ipv4-net" / "ipv4-net-mask" / "ipv6-addr" / "ipv6-net" /
  "ipv6-net-mask" / "mac" / "site-uri" / "domain-name" /
  "domain-to-ipv4" / "domain-to-ipv6" /
  "domain-to-ipv4-timestamp" / "domain-to-ipv6-timestamp" /
  "ipv4-port" / "ipv6-port" / "windows-reg-key" / "file-hash" /
  "email-x-mailer" / "email-subject" / "http-user-agent" /
  "http-request-uri" / "mutex" / "file-path" / "user-name" /

```

```

"ext-value",
  ? iodef-ext-type => text,
  ? iodef-BulkObservableFormat => BulkObservableFormat,
  iodef-BulkObservableList => text,
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

BulkObservableFormat = {
  (iodef-Hash => Hash // iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType])
}

IndicatorExpression = {
  ? iodef-operator => "not" / "and" / "or" / "xor" .default "and",
  ? iodef-ext-operator => text,
  ? iodef-IndicatorExpression => [+ IndicatorExpression],
  ? iodef-Observable => [+ Observable],
  ? iodef-uid-ref => [+ IDREFType],
  ? iodef-IndicatorReference => [+ IndicatorReference],
  ? iodef-Confidence => Confidence,
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

IndicatorReference = {
  (iodef-uid-ref => IDREFType // iodef-euid-ref => text),
  ? iodef-version => text
}

AttackPhase = {
  ? iodef-AttackPhaseID => [+ text],
  ? iodef-URL => [+ URLtype],
  ? iodef-Description => [+ MLStringType],
  ? iodef-AdditionalData => [+ ExtensionType]
}

```

Figure 5: Data Model in CDDL

7. IANA Considerations

This document has no IANA actions.

8. Security Considerations

This document provides a mapping from XML IODEF defined in [RFC7970] to JSON, and Section 3.2 describes several issues that arise when converting XML IODEF and JSON IODEF. Though it does not provide any further security considerations other than the one described in [RFC7970], implementers of this document should be aware of those issues to avoid any unintended outcome.

9. References

9.1. Normative References

- [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", BCP 14, RFC 2119, DOI 10.17487/RFC2119, March 1997, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2119>>.
- [RFC3986] Berners-Lee, T., Fielding, R., and L. Masinter, "Uniform Resource Identifier (URI): Generic Syntax", STD 66, RFC 3986, DOI 10.17487/RFC3986, January 2005, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3986>>.
- [RFC4648] Josefsson, S., "The Base16, Base32, and Base64 Data Encodings", RFC 4648, DOI 10.17487/RFC4648, October 2006, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4648>>.
- [RFC7049] Bormann, C. and P. Hoffman, "Concise Binary Object Representation (CBOR)", RFC 7049, DOI 10.17487/RFC7049, October 2013, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7049>>.

- [RFC7203] Takahashi, T., Landfield, K., and Y. Kadobayashi, "An Incident Object Description Exchange Format (IODEF) Extension for Structured Cybersecurity Information", RFC 7203, DOI 10.17487/RFC7203, April 2014, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7203>>.
- [RFC7970] Danyliw, R., "The Incident Object Description Exchange Format Version 2", RFC 7970, DOI 10.17487/RFC7970, November 2016, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7970>>.
- [RFC8174] Leiba, B., "Ambiguity of Uppercase vs Lowercase in RFC 2119 Key Words", BCP 14, RFC 8174, DOI 10.17487/RFC8174, May 2017, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8174>>.
- [RFC8259] Bray, T., Ed., "The JavaScript Object Notation (JSON) Data Interchange Format", STD 90, RFC 8259, DOI 10.17487/RFC8259, December 2017, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8259>>.
- [RFC8610] Birkholz, H., Vigano, C., and C. Bormann, "Concise Data Definition Language (CDDL): A Notational Convention to Express Concise Binary Object Representation (CBOR) and JSON Data Structures", RFC 8610, DOI 10.17487/RFC8610, June 2019, <<https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8610>>.

9.2. Informative References

[JSON-SCHEMA]

Wright, A., Andrews, H., and B. Hutton, "JSON Schema Validation: A Vocabulary for Structural Validation of JSON", Work in Progress, Internet-Draft, draft-handrews-json-schema-validation-02, 17 September 2019, <<https://tools.ietf.org/html/draft-handrews-json-schema-validation-02>>.

Appendix A. Data Types Used in This Document

The CDDL prelude used in this document is mapped to JSON as shown in the table below.

CDDL Prelude	Use of JSON	Instance	Validation
bytes	n/a	string	tool available
text	string	string	unnecessary
tdate	n/a	string	date-time per Section 7.3.1 of [JSON-SCHEMA]
integer	n/a	number	integer
eb64legacy	n/a	string	tool available
uri	n/a	string	uri per Section 7.3.6 of [JSON-SCHEMA]
float32	float32	number	unnecessary

Table 5: CDDL Prelude Mapping in JSON

Appendix B. The IODEF Data Model (JSON Schema)

This section provides a JSON schema [JSON-SCHEMA] that defines the IODEF data model defined in this document. Note that this section is informative.

```
{ "$schema": "https://json-schema.org/draft-04/schema#",
  "definitions": {
```

```

"action": {"enum": ["nothing", "contact-source-site",
  "contact-target-site", "contact-sender", "investigate",
  "block-host", "block-network", "block-port",
  "rate-limit-host", "rate-limit-network",
  "rate-limit-port", "redirect-traffic", "honeypot",
  "upgrade-software", "rebuild-asset", "harden-asset",
  "remediate-other", "status-triage", "status-new-info",
  "watch-and-report", "training", "defined-coa", "other",
  "ext-value"]},
"duration": {"enum": ["second", "minute", "hour", "day",
  "month", "quarter", "year", "ext-value"]},
"SpecID": {
  "enum": ["urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:mile:mmdef:1.2",
  "private"]},
"lang": {
  "type": "string", "pattern":
  "^$|[a-zA-Z]{1,8}(-[a-zA-Z0-9]{1,8})*$",
"purpose": {"enum": ["traceback", "mitigation",
  "reporting", "watch", "other", "ext-value"]},
"restriction": {"enum": ["public", "partner",
  "need-to-know", "private", "default", "white", "green",
  "amber", "red", "ext-value"]},
"status": {"enum": ["new", "in-progress", "forwarded",
  "resolved", "future", "ext-value"]},
"DATETIME": {"type": "string", "format": "date-time"},
"BYTE": {"type": "string"},
"PortlistType": {
  "type": "string", "pattern":
  "[0-9]+(\\-[0-9]+)?(,[0-9]+(\\-[0-9]+)?)*",
"TimeZonetype": {
  "type": "string", "pattern":
  "Z|[\\+\\-](0[0-9]|1[0-4]):[0-5][0-9]",
"URLtype": {
  "type": "string",
  "pattern":
  "^(([^:/?#]+):)?(//([^/?#]*))?([^?#]*)(\\?([^#]*))
  ?(#[.]*)?$",
"IDtype": {"type": "string", "pattern":
  "[a-zA-Z_][a-zA-Z0-9_-]*"},
"IDREFType": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
"MLStringType": {
  "oneOf": [{"type": "string"},
  {"type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "value": {"type": "string"},
    "lang": {"$ref": "#/definitions/lang"},
    "translation-id": {"type": "string"},
    "required": ["value"],
    "additionalProperties": false}}}],
"PositiveFloatType": {"type": "number", "minimum": 0},
"PAddressType": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
"ExtensionType": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "value": {"type": "string"},
    "name": {"type": "string"},
    "dtype": {"enum": ["boolean", "byte", "bytes",
    "character", "json", "date-time", "ntpstamp",
    "integer", "portlist", "real", "string", "file",
    "path", "frame", "packet", "ipv4-packet",
    "ipv6-packet", "url", "csv", "winreg",
    "xml", "ext-value"], "default": "string"},
    "ext-dtype": {"type": "string"},
    "meaning": {"type": "string"},
    "formatid": {"type": "string"},
    "restriction": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/restriction", "default":
      "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"}},
  "required": ["value", "dtype"],

```

```

    "additionalProperties":false},
"ExtensionTypeList": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionType"},
  "minItems": 1},
"SoftwareType": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "SoftwareReference":{
      "$ref":"#/definitions/SoftwareReference"},
    "URL": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype",
        "minItems": 1}},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1 }},
    "required": [],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"SoftwareReference": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "value": {"type": "string"},
    "spec-name": {"enum": ["custom", "cpe", "swid",
      "ext-value"]},
    "ext-spec-name": {"type": "string"},
    "dtype": {"enum": ["bytes", "integer", "real", "string",
      "xml", "ext-value"], "default": "string"},
    "ext-dtype": {"type": "string"}},
    "required": ["spec-name"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"STRUCTUREDINFO": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "SpecID": {"$ref":"#/definitions/SpecID"},
    "ext-SpecID": {"type": "string"},
    "ContentID": {"type": "string"},
    "RawData": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref":"#/definitions/BYTE"},
      "minItems": 1
    },
  },
  "Reference": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Reference"},
    "minItems": 1
  },
  },
  "Platform": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Platform"},
    "minItems": 1
  },
  },
  "Scoring": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Scoring"},
    "minItems": 1}},
"allOf": [
  {"required": ["SpecID"]},
  {"anyOf": [
    {"oneOf": [
      {"required":["Reference"]},
      {"required":["RawData"]}]}],
    {"not" : {"required":["Reference", "RawData"]}}]}],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"Platform": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "SpecID": {"$ref":"#/definitions/SpecID"},
    "ext-SpecID": {"type": "string"},
    "ContentID": {"type": "string"},

```



```

"RawData": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/BYTE"},
  "minItems": 1
},
"Reference": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Reference"},
  "minItems": 1},
"required": ["SpecID"],
"additionalProperties": false},
"Scoring": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "SpecID": {"$ref": "#/definitions/SpecID"},
    "ext-SpecID": {"type": "string"},
    "ContentID": {"type": "string"},
    "RawData": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/BYTE"},
      "minItems": 1
    },
    "Reference": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Reference"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "required": ["SpecID"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"Incident": {
  "title": "Incident",
  "description": "JSON schema for Incident class",
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "purpose": {"$ref": "#/definitions/purpose"},
    "ext-purpose": {"type": "string"},
    "status": {"$ref": "#/definitions/status"},
    "ext-status": {"type": "string"},
    "lang": {"$ref": "#/definitions/lang"},
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
    "IncidentID": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IncidentID"},
    "AlternativeID": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/AlternativeID"},
    "RelatedActivity": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/RelatedActivity"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "DetectTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "StartTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "EndTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "RecoveryTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "ReportTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "GenerationTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Discovery": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Discovery"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Assessment": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Assessment"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Method": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Method"},
      "minItems": 1},

```

```

"Contact": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Contact"},
  "minItems": 1},
"EventData": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/EventData"},
  "minItems": 1},
"Indicator": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Indicator"},
  "minItems": 1},
"History": {"$ref": "#/definitions/History"},
"AdditionalData": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
"required": ["IncidentID", "GenerationTime", "Contact",
  "purpose"],
"additionalProperties": false},
"IncidentID": {
  "title": "IncidentID",
  "description": "JSON schema for IncidentID class",
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "id": {"type": "string"},
    "name": {"type": "string"},
    "instance": {"type": "string"},
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"}},
  "required": ["id", "name"],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"AlternativeID": {
  "title": "AlternativeID",
  "description": "JSON schema for AlternativeID class",
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "IncidentID": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IncidentID"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"}},
  "required": ["IncidentID"],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"RelatedActivity": {
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "IncidentID": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IncidentID"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "URL": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "ThreatActor": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/ThreatActor"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Campaign": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Campaign"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "IndicatorID": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IndicatorID"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Confidence": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Confidence"},

```

```

    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"type": "string"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
  "additionalProperties": false},
"ThreatActor": {
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "ThreatActorID": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"type": "string"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "URL": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
  "additionalProperties": false},
"Campaign": {
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "CampaignID": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"type": "string"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "URL": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
"Contact": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "role": {
      "enum": ["creator", "reporter", "admin", "tech",
        "provider", "user", "billing", "legal",
        "irt", "abuse", "cc", "cc-irt", "leo",
        "vendor", "vendor-support", "victim",
        "victim-notified", "ext-value"]},
    "ext-role": {"type": "string"},
    "type": {
      "enum": ["person", "organization", "ext-value"]},
    "ext-type": {"type": "string"},
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "ContactName": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "ContactTitle": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Description": {

```

```

    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "RegistryHandle": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/RegistryHandle"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "PostalAddress": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/PostalAddress"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "Email": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Email"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "Telephone": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Telephone"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "Timezone": {"$ref": "#/definitions/TimeZonetype"},
  "Contact": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Contact"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "AdditionalData": {
    "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"},
  "required": ["role", "type"],
  "additionalProperties": false},
  "RegistryHandle": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "handle": {"type": "string"},
      "registry": {
        "enum": ["internic", "apnic", "arin", "lacnic",
          "ripe", "afrinic", "local", "ext-value"]},
      "ext-registry": {"type": "string"}},
    "required": ["handle", "registry"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "PostalAddress": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "type": {
        "enum": ["street", "mailing", "ext-value"]},
      "ext-type": {"type": "string"},
      "PAddress": {"$ref": "#/definitions/PAddressType"},
      "Description": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
        "minItems": 1}},
      "required": ["PAddress"],
      "additionalProperties": false},
  "Email": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "type": {
        "enum": ["direct", "hotline", "ext-value"]},
      "ext-type": {"type": "string"},
      "EmailTo": {"type": "string"},
      "Description": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
        "minItems": 1}},
      "required": ["EmailTo"],
      "additionalProperties": false},
  "Telephone": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "type": {
        "enum": ["wired", "mobile", "fax", "hotline",
          "ext-value"]},
      "ext-type": {"type": "string"},

```

```

    "TelephoneNumber": {"type": "string"},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1}},
    "required": ["TelephoneNumber"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "Discovery": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "source": {
        "enum": ["nidps", "hips", "siem", "av",
          "third-party-monitoring", "incident", "os-log",
          "application-log", "device-log", "network-flow",
          "passive-dns", "investigation", "audit",
          "internal-notification", "external-notification",
          "leo", "partner", "actor", "unknown", "ext-value"]},
      "ext-source": {"type": "string"},
      "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
        "default": "private"},
      "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
      "Description": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
        "minItems": 1},
      "Contact": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Contact"},
        "minItems": 1},
      "DetectionPattern": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DetectionPattern"},
        "minItems": 1}},
      "required": [],
      "additionalProperties": false},
    "DetectionPattern": {
      "type": "object",
      "properties": {
        "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
          "default": "private"},
        "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
        "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
        "Application": {"$ref": "#/definitions/SoftwareType"},
        "Description": {
          "type": "array",
          "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
          "minItems": 1},
        "DetectionConfiguration": {
          "type": "array",
          "items": {"type": "string"},
          "minItems": 1}},
        "allOf": [
          {"required": ["Application"]},
          {"oneOf": [
            {"required": ["Description"]},
            {"required": ["DetectionConfiguration"]}]}]}],
        "additionalProperties": false},
      "Method": {
        "type": "object",
        "properties": {
          "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
            "default": "private"},
          "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
          "Reference": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Reference"},
            "minItems": 1},
          "Description": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
            "minItems": 1},

```

```

"AttackPattern": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/STRUCTUREDINFO"},
  "minItems": 1},
"Vulnerability": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/STRUCTUREDINFO"},
  "minItems": 1},
"Weakness": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/STRUCTUREDINFO"},
  "minItems": 1},
"AdditionalData": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"},
"required": [],
"additionalProperties": false},
"Reference": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
    "ReferenceName": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ReferenceName"},
    "URL": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1}},
  "required": [],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"ReferenceName" : {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "specIndex": {"type": "number"},
    "ID": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"}},
  "required": ["specIndex", "ID"],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"Assessment": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "occurrence": {"enum": ["actual", "potential"]},
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
    "IncidentCategory": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Impact": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {
        "properties": {
          "SystemImpact": {
            "$ref": "#/definitions/SystemImpact"},
          "BusinessImpact": {
            "$ref": "#/definitions/BusinessImpact"},
          "TimeImpact": {"$ref": "#/definitions/TimeImpact"},
          "MonetaryImpact": {
            "$ref": "#/definitions/MonetaryImpact"},
          "IntendedImpact": {
            "$ref": "#/definitions/BusinessImpact"}},
          "additionalProperties": false},
        "minItems" : 1
      },
    },
"Counter": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Counter"},
  "minItems": 1},

```

```

    "MitigatingFactor": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Cause": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Confidence": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Confidence"},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"},
    "required": ["Impact"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "SystemImpact": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "severity": {"enum": ["low", "medium", "high"]},
      "completion": {"enum": ["failed", "succeeded"]},
      "type": {
        "enum": ["takeover-account", "takeover-service",
          "takeover-system", "cps-manipulation", "cps-damage",
          "availability-data", "availability-account",
          "availability-service", "availability-system",
          "damaged-system", "damaged-data",
          "breach-proprietary", "breach-privacy",
          "breach-credential", "breach-configuration",
          "integrity-data", "integrity-configuration",
          "integrity-hardware", "traffic-redirection",
          "monitoring-traffic", "monitoring-host",
          "policy", "unknown", "ext-value"]},
        "ext-type": {"type": "string"},
        "Description": {
          "type": "array",
          "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
          "minItems": 1}},
        "required": ["type"],
        "additionalProperties": false},
    "BusinessImpact": {
      "type": "object",
      "properties": {
        "severity": {"enum": ["none", "low", "medium", "high",
          "unknown", "ext-value"], "default": "unknown"},
        "ext-severity": {"type": "string"},
        "type": {"enum": ["breach-proprietary",
          "breach-privacy", "breach-credential",
          "loss-of-integrity", "loss-of-service",
          "theft-financial", "theft-service",
          "degraded-reputation", "asset-damage",
          "asset-manipulation", "legal", "extortion",
          "unknown", "ext-value"]},
        "ext-type": {"type": "string"},
        "Description": {
          "type": "array",
          "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
          "minItems": 1}},
        "required": ["type"],
        "additionalProperties": false},
    "TimeImpact": {
      "type": "object",
      "properties": {
        "value": {"$ref": "#/definitions/PositiveFloatType"},
        "severity": {"enum": ["low", "medium", "high"]},
        "metric": {"enum": ["labor", "elapsed", "downtime",
          "ext-value"]},
        "ext-metric": {"type": "string"},
        "duration": {
          "$ref": "#/definitions/duration", "default": "hour"},
        "ext-duration": {"type": "string"}},
        "required": ["value", "metric"],
        "additionalProperties": false},
    "MonetaryImpact": {

```

```

"type": "object",
"properties": {
  "value": {"$ref": "#/definitions/PositiveFloatType"},
  "severity": {"enum": ["low", "medium", "high"]},
  "currency": {"type": "string"}},
"required": ["value"],
"additionalProperties": false},
"Confidence": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "value": {"type": "number"},
    "rating": {"enum": ["low", "medium", "high", "numeric",
      "unknown", "ext-value"]},
    "ext-rating": {"type": "string"}},
  "required": ["value", "rating"],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"History": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "HistoryItem": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/HistoryItem"},
      "minItems": 1}},
    "required": ["HistoryItem"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"HistoryItem": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "action": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/action", "default": "other"},
    "ext-action": {"type": "string"},
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
    "DateTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "IncidentID": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IncidentID"},
    "Contact": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Contact"},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "DefinedCOA": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"type": "string"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
    "required": ["DateTime", "action"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"EventData": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
    "Description": {"type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"}},
    "DetectTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "StartTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "EndTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "RecoveryTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "ReportTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "Contact": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Contact"},
      "minItems": 1},

```



```

"Discovery": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Discovery"},
  "minItems": 1},
"Assessment": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Assessment"},
"Method": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Method"},
  "minItems": 1},
"System": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/System"},
  "minItems": 1},
"Expectation": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Expectation"},
  "minItems": 1},
"RecordData": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/RecordData"},
  "minItems": 1},
"EventData": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/EventData"},
  "minItems": 1},
"AdditionalData": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"},
"required": [],
"additionalProperties": false},
"Expectation": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "action": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/action", "default": "other"},
    "ext-action": {"type": "string"},
    "severity": {"enum": ["low", "medium", "high"]},
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "default"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "DefinedCOA": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"type": "string"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "StartTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "EndTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "Contact": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Contact"}},
  "required": [],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"System": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "category": {
      "enum": ["source", "target", "intermediate", "sensor",
        "infrastructure", "ext-value"]},
    "ext-category": {"type": "string"},
    "interface": {"type": "string"},
    "spoofed": {
      "enum": ["unknown", "yes", "no"], "default": "unknown"},
    "virtual": {
      "enum": ["yes", "no", "unknown"], "default": "unknown"},
    "ownership": {
      "enum": ["organization", "personal", "partner",
        "customer", "no-relationship", "unknown",
        "ext-value"]},
    "ext-ownership": {"type": "string"},
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",

```

```

        "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
    "Node": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Node"},
    "NodeRole": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/NodeRole"},
        "minItems": 1},
    "Service": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Service"},
        "minItems": 1},
    "OperatingSystem": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/SoftwareType"},
        "minItems": 1},
    "Counter": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Counter"},
        "minItems": 1},
    "AssetID": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"type": "string"},
        "minItems": 1},
    "Description": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
        "minItems": 1},
    "AdditionalData": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
    "required": ["Node"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"Node": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
        "DomainData": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DomainData"},
            "minItems": 1},
        "Address": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Address"},
            "minItems": 1},
        "PostalAddress": {
            "$ref": "#/definitions/PostalAddress"},
        "Location": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
            "minItems": 1},
        "Counter": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Counter"},
            "minItems": 1}},
    "anyOf": [
        {"required": ["DomainData"]},
        {"required": ["Address"]}
    ],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"Address": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
        "value": {"type": "string"},
        "category": {
            "enum": ["asn", "atm", "e-mail", "ipv4-addr", "ipv4-net",
                "ipv4-net-masked", "ipv4-net-mask", "ipv6-addr",
                "ipv6-net", "ipv6-net-masked", "mac", "site-uri",
                "ext-value"], "default": "ipv6-addr"},
        "ext-category": {"type": "string"},
        "vlan-name": {"type": "string"},
        "vlan-num": {"type": "number"},
        "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"}},

```

```

    "required": ["value", "category"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "NodeRole": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "category": {
        "enum":["client", "client-enterprise",
          "client-partner", "client-remote", "client-kiosk",
          "client-mobile", "server-internal", "server-public",
          "www", "mail", "webmail", "messaging", "streaming",
          "voice", "file", "ftp", "p2p", "name", "directory",
          "credential", "print", "application", "database",
          "backup", "dhcp", "assessment", "source-control",
          "config-management", "monitoring", "infra",
          "infra-firewall", "infra-router", "infra-switch",
          "camera", "proxy", "remote-access", "log",
          "virtualization", "pos", "scada",
          "scada-supervisory", "sinkhole", "honeypot",
          "anonymization", "c2-server", "malware-distribution",
          "drop-server", "hop-point", "reflector",
          "phishing-site", "spear-phishing-site",
          "recruiting-site", "fraudulent-site",
          "ext-value"]},
      "ext-category": {"type": "string"},
      "Description": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
        "minItems": 1}},
    "required": ["category"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "Counter": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "value": {"type": "number"},
      "type": {
        "enum": ["count", "peak", "average", "ext-value"]},
      "ext-type": {"type": "string"},
      "unit": {"enum": ["byte", "mbit", "packet", "flow",
        "session", "alert", "message", "event", "host",
        "site", "organization", "ext-value"]},
      "ext-unit": {"type": "string"},
      "meaning": {"type": "string"},
      "duration": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/duration", "default": "hour"},
      "ext-duration": {"type": "string"}},
    "required": ["value", "type", "unit"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "DomainData": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "system-status": {
        "enum": ["spoofed", "fraudulent", "innocent-hacked",
          "innocent-hijacked", "unknown", "ext-value"]},
      "ext-system-status": {"type": "string"},
      "domain-status": {
        "enum": [ "reservedDelegation", "assignedAndActive",
          "assignedAndInactive", "assignedAndOnHold",
          "revoked", "transferPending",
          "registryLock", "registrarLock",
          "other", "unknown", "ext-value"]},
      "ext-domain-status": {"type": "string"},
      "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
      "Name": {"type": "string"},
      "DateDomainWasChecked": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
      "RegistrationDate": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
      "ExpirationDate": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
      "RelatedDNS": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionType"},

```

```

    "minItems": 1},
    "NameServers": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/NameServers"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "DomainContacts": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/DomainContacts"}},
    "required": ["Name", "system-status", "domain-status"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "NameServers": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "Server": {"type": "string"},
      "Address": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Address"},
        "minItems": 1}},
    "required": ["Server", "Address"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "DomainContacts": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "SameDomainContact": {"type": "string"},
      "Contact": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Contact"},
        "minItems": 1}},
    "oneOf": [
      {"required": ["SameDomainContact"]},
      {"required": ["Contact"]}],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "Service": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "ip-protocol": {"type": "number"},
      "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
      "serviceName": {"$ref": "#/definitions/ServiceName"},
      "Port": {"type": "number"},
      "Portlist": {"$ref": "#/definitions/PortlistType"},
      "ProtoCode": {"type": "number"},
      "ProtoType": {"type": "number"},
      "ProtoField": {"type": "number"},
      "ApplicationHeaderField": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"},
      "EmailData": {"$ref": "#/definitions/EmailData"},
      "Application": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/SoftwareType"}},
    "required": [],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "ServiceName": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "IANAService": {"type": "string"},
      "URL": {
        "type": "array", "items": {
          "$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype"}},
      "Description": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
        "minItems": 1}},
    "required": [],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "EmailData": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
      "EmailTo": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"type": "string"},
        "minItems": 1},
      "EmailFrom": {"type": "string"},

```

```

"EmailSubject": {"type": "string"},
"EmailX-Mailer": {"type": "string"},
"EmailHeaderField": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionType"},
  "minItems": 1},
"EmailHeaders": {"type": "string"},
"EmailBody": {"type": "string"},
"EmailMessage": {"type": "string"},
"HashData": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/HashData"},
  "minItems": 1},
"Signature": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/BYTE"},
  "minItems": 1}},
"required": [],
"additionalProperties": false},
"RecordData": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
    "DateTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
    "Description": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Application": {"$ref": "#/definitions/SoftwareType"},
    "RecordPattern": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/RecordPattern"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "RecordItem": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "URL": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "FileData": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/FileData"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "WindowsRegistryKeysModified": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/WindowsRegistryKeysModified"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "CertificateData": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/CertificateData"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
    "required": [],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"RecordPattern": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "value": {"type": "string"},
    "type": {
      "enum": ["regex", "binary", "xpath", "ext-value"],
      "default": "regex"},
    "ext-type": {"type": "string"},
    "offset": {"type": "number"},
    "offsetunit": {"enum": ["line", "byte", "ext-value"]} ,

```

```

        "default": "line"},
    "ext-offsetunit": {"type": "string"},
    "instance": {"type": "number"}},
    "required": ["value", "type"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"WindowsRegistryKeysModified": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
        "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
        "Key": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Key"},
            "minItems": 1}},
        "required": ["Key"],
        "additionalProperties": false},
"Key": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
        "registryaction": {"enum": ["add-key", "add-value",
            "delete-key", "delete-value",
            "modify-key", "modify-value",
            "ext-value"]},
        "ext-registryaction": {"type": "string"},
        "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
        "KeyName": {"type": "string"},
        "KeyValue": {"type": "string"}},
        "required": ["KeyName"],
        "additionalProperties": false},
"CertificateData": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
        "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
            "default": "private"},
        "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
        "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
        "Certificate": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Certificate"},
            "minItems": 1}},
        "required": ["Certificate"],
        "additionalProperties": false},
"Certificate": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
        "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
        "X509Data": {"$ref": "#/definitions/BYTE"},
        "Description": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
            "minItems": 1}},
        "required": ["X509Data"],
        "additionalProperties": false},
"FileData": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
        "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction"},
        "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
        "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
        "File": {
            "type": "array",
            "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/File"},
            "minItems": 1}},
        "required": ["File"],
        "additionalProperties": false},
"File": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
        "observable-id": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDtype"},
        "FileName": {"type": "string"},
        "FileSize": {"type": "number"},
        "FileType": {"type": "string"},

```

```

"URL": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype"},
  "minItems": 1},
"HashData": {"$ref": "#/definitions/HashData"},
"Signature": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/BYTE"},
  "minItems": 1},
"AssociatedSoftware": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/SoftwareType"},
"FileProperties": {
  "type": "array",
  "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionType"},
  "minItems": 1}},
"required": [],
"additionalProperties": false},
"HashData": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "scope": {"enum": ["file-contents", "file-pe-section",
      "file-pe-iat", "file-pe-resource", "file-pdf-object",
      "email-hash", "email-headers-hash", "email-body-hash",
      "ext-value"]},
    "HashTargetID": {"type": "string"},
    "Hash": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Hash"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "FuzzyHash": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/FuzzyHash"},
      "minItems": 1}},
    "required": ["scope"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"Hash": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "DigestMethod": {"$ref": "#/definitions/BYTE"},
    "DigestValue": {"$ref": "#/definitions/BYTE"},
    "CanonicalizationMethod": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/BYTE"},
    "Application": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/SoftwareType"}},
    "required": ["DigestMethod", "DigestValue"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"FuzzyHash": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "FuzzyHashValue": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Application": {"$ref": "#/definitions/SoftwareType"},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
    "required": ["FuzzyHashValue"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"Indicator": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "IndicatorID": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IndicatorID"},
    "AlternativeIndicatorID": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/AlternativeIndicatorID"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Description": {

```

```

    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "StartTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
  "EndTime": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DATETIME"},
  "Confidence": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Confidence"},
  "Contact": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Contact"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "Observable": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Observable"},
  "uid-ref": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDREFType"},
  "IndicatorExpression": {
    "$ref": "#/definitions/IndicatorExpression"},
  "IndicatorReference": {
    "$ref": "#/definitions/IndicatorReference"},
  "NodeRole": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/NodeRole"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "AttackPhase": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/AttackPhase"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "Reference": {
    "type": "array",
    "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Reference"},
    "minItems": 1},
  "AdditionalData": {
    "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
  "allOf": [
    {"required": ["IndicatorID"]},
    {"oneOf": [
      {"required": ["Observable"]},
      {"required": ["uid-ref"]},
      {"required": ["IndicatorExpression"]},
      {"required": ["IndicatorReference"]}]}],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"IndicatorID": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "id": {"type": "string"},
    "name": {"type": "string"},
    "version": {"type": "string"}},
  "required": ["id", "name", "version"],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"AlternativeIndicatorID": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "IndicatorID": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IndicatorID"},
      "minItems": 1}},
  "required": ["IndicatorID"],
  "additionalProperties": false},
"Observable": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "restriction": {"$ref": "#/definitions/restriction",
      "default": "private"},
    "ext-restriction": {"type": "string"},
    "System": {"$ref": "#/definitions/System"},
    "Address": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Address"},
    "DomainData": {"$ref": "#/definitions/DomainData"},
    "EmailData": {"$ref": "#/definitions/EmailData"},
    "Service": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Service"},
    "WindowsRegistryKeysModified": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/WindowsRegistryKeysModified"},

```



```

"FileData": {"$ref": "#/definitions/FileData"},
"CertificateData": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/CertificateData"},
"RegistryHandle": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/RegistryHandle"},
"RecordData": {"$ref": "#/definitions/RecordData"},
"EventData": {"$ref": "#/definitions/EventData"},
"Incident": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Incident"},
"Expectation": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Expectation"},
"Reference": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Reference"},
"Assessment": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Assessment"},
"DetectionPattern": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/DetectionPattern"},
"HistoryItem": {"$ref": "#/definitions/HistoryItem"},
"BulkObservable": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/BulkObservable"},
"AdditionalData": {
  "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
"oneOf": [
  {"required": ["System"]},
  {"required": ["Address"]},
  {"required": ["DomainData"]},
  {"required": ["EmailData"]},
  {"required": ["Service"]},
  {"required": ["WindowsRegistryKeysModified"]},
  {"required": ["FileData"]},
  {"required": ["CertificateData"]},
  {"required": ["RegistryHandle"]},
  {"required": ["RecordData"]},
  {"required": ["EventData"]},
  {"required": ["Incident"]},
  {"required": ["Expectation"]},
  {"required": ["Reference"]},
  {"required": ["Assessment"]},
  {"required": ["DetectionPattern"]},
  {"required": ["HistoryItem"]},
  {"required": ["BulkObservable"]},
  {"required": ["AdditionalData"]}],
"additionalProperties": false},
"BulkObservable": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "type": {"enum": ["asn", "atm", "e-mail", "ipv4-addr",
      "ipv4-net", "ipv4-net-mask", "ipv6-addr", "ipv6-net",
      "ipv6-net-mask", "mac", "site-uri", "domain-name",
      "domain-to-ipv4", "domain-to-ipv6",
      "domain-to-ipv4-timestamp",
      "domain-to-ipv6-timestamp", "ipv4-port", "ipv6-port",
      "windows-reg-key", "file-hash", "email-x-mailer",
      "email-subject", "http-user-agent",
      "http-request-url", "mutex", "file-path", "user-name",
      "ext-value"]},
    "ext-type": {"type": "string"},
    "BulkObservableFormat": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/BulkObservableFormat"},
    "BulkObservableList": {"type": "string"},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
    "required": ["BulkObservableList"],
    "additionalProperties": false},
"BulkObservableFormat": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "Hash": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Hash"},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
    "oneOf": [
      {"required": ["Hash"]},
      {"required": ["AdditionalData"]}
    ],
    "additionalProperties": false},

```

```

"IndicatorExpression": {
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "operator": {
      "enum": ["not", "and", "or", "xor"], "default": "and"},
    "ext-operator": {"type": "string"},
    "IndicatorExpression": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/IndicatorExpression"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Observable": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Observable"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "uid-ref": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDREFType"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "IndicatorReference": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/IndicatorReference"},
      "minItems": 1},
    "Confidence": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Confidence"},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
    "required": [],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "IndicatorReference": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "uid-ref": {"$ref": "#/definitions/IDREFType"},
      "euid-ref": {"type": "string"},
      "version": {"type": "string"}},
    "oneOf": [
      {"required": ["uid-ref"]},
      {"required": ["euid-ref"]}
    ],
    "additionalProperties": false},
  "AttackPhase": {
    "type": "object",
    "properties": {
      "AttackPhaseID": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"type": "string"},
        "minItems": 1},
      "URL": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/URLtype"},
        "minItems": 1},
      "Description": {
        "type": "array",
        "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/MLStringType"},
        "minItems": 1},
      "AdditionalData": {
        "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
      "required": [],
      "additionalProperties": false}},
  "title": "IODEF-Document",
  "description": "JSON schema for IODEF-Document class",
  "type": "object",
  "properties": {
    "version": {"type": "string"},
    "lang": {"$ref": "#/definitions/lang"},
    "format-id": {"type": "string"},
    "private-enum-name": {"type": "string"},
    "private-enum-id": {"type": "string"},
    "Incident": {
      "type": "array",
      "items": {"$ref": "#/definitions/Incident"},

```

```
    "minItems": 1},
    "AdditionalData": {
      "$ref": "#/definitions/ExtensionTypeList"}},
    "required": ["version", "Incident"],
    "additionalProperties": false}
```

Figure 6: JSON Schema

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank Henk Birkholz, Carsten Bormann, Benjamin Kaduk, Alexey Melnikov, Yasuaki Morita, and Takahiko Nagata for their insightful comments on this document and CDDL.

Authors' Addresses

Takeshi Takahashi
National Institute of Information and Communications Technology
4-2-1 Nukui-Kitamachi, Koganei, Tokyo
184-8795
Japan

Phone: +81 42 327 5862
Email: takeshi_takahashi@nict.go.jp

Roman Danyliw
CERT, Software Engineering Institute, Carnegie Mellon University
4500 Fifth Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA
United States of America

Email: rdd@cert.org

Mio Suzuki
National Institute of Information and Communications Technology
4-2-1 Nukui-Kitamachi, Koganei, Tokyo
184-8795
Japan

Email: mio@nict.go.jp